مرگ تخصص

چرا صدای متخصصان شنیده نمی‌شود

یادداشت‌ها

توماس نیکولز

ترجمه‌ی

حسین خدادادی

آموخته

پی‌نوشت‌ها

مقدمه

۱. Pride Chigwedere et al., **“Estimating the Lost Benefits of Antiretroviral Drug Use in South Africa,”** *Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes* 49 (4), December 1, 2008.

۲. Kyle Dropp, Joshua D. Kertzer, and Thomas Zeitzoff, **“The Less Americans Know about Ukraine’s Location, the More They Want U.S. to Intervene,”** *Monkey Cage* Blog, *Washington Post* online, April 7, 2014.

فصل ۱

۱. José Ortega y Gasset, *The Revolt of the Masses* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1993), 16–18.

۲. Richard Hofstadter, *Anti-Intellectualism in American Life* (New York: Vintage, 1963), 34.

۳. Ilya Somin, **"Political Ignorance in America,"** in Mark Bauerlein and Adam Bellow, eds., *The State of the American Mind* (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton, 2015), 163–164.

٤. Dana Goodyear, **"Raw Deal: California Cracks Down on an Underground Gourmet Club,"** *New Yorker,* April 30, 2012.

٥. Olga Khazan, **"27% of Surgeons Still Think Obamacare Has Death Panels,"** *Atlantic* online, December 19, 2013.

٦. Kaiser Family Foundation, 2013 Survey of Americans on the US Role in Global Health.

۷. Henry Blodget, **"Here's What Day Traders Don't Understand,"** *Business Insider*, March 29, 2010.

فصل ۲

۱. See David Dunning, **“We Are All Confident Idiots,”** *Pacific Standard* online, October 27, 2014.

۲. Justin Kruger and David Dunning, **“Unskilled and Unaware of It: How Difficulties in Recognizing One’s Own Incompetence Lead to Inflated Self- Assessments,”** *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 77(6), December 1999, 1121–1122.

۳. Dunning, **“We Are All Confident Idiots.”**

٤. John Allen Paulos, *Innumeracy: Mathematical Illiteracy and Its Consequences* (New York: Hill and Wang, 2001), 9.

۵. Michael Crichton, **“Panic in the Sheets,”** *Playboy*, December 1991; archived at MichaelCrichton.com.

٦. در آمار بحثی به‌نام «تحلیل بیزی» (به‌نام یک ریاضی‌دان انگلیسی قرن هجدهم) وجود دارد که به این مسئله می‌پردازد.

۷. Social scientists, no less than any other, are aware of this problem. See Charles O. Jones, **"Doing before Knowing: Concept Development in Political Research,"** *American Journal of Political Science* 18(1), February 1974.

۸. Maria Konnikova, **"How a Gay-Marriage Study Went Wrong,"** *New Yorker.* online, May 22, 2015.

۹. Jonathan Kay, **"Has Internet-Fueled Conspiracy Mongering Crested?,"** in Mark Bauerline and Adam Bellow, eds., *The State of the American Mind* (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton, 2015), 138–139.

۱۰. راس ای. چیتِ پژوهشگر می‌گوید مدیریت ضعیف پرونده‌های دهه‌ی ۱۹۸۰ و ۱۹۹۰ پیامدهای تراژیکی داشت و افکار عمومی مثل پاندول تغییر موضع داد: یک بار هرچه کودکان می‌گفتند باور می‌کردند و بار دیگر هیچ ادعای آزاری را جدی نمی‌گرفتند. در عین حال، مؤلفه‌ی شیطانی بخشی از هیستری بود و بررسی‌های بعدی پژوهشگران و پلیس نشان داد هیچ‌گونه مدرکی درباره‌ی وجود چنین شبکه‌هایی در مهدکودک‌ها یا جای دیگر در دست نیست. رجوع کنید به:

Ross E. Cheit, *The Witch-Hunt Narrative* New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.

۱۱. Jef Rouner, **"Guide to Arguing with a Snopes-Denier,"** *Houston Press*, April 2, 2014.

۱۲. Ali Mahmoodi et al., **"Equality Bias Impairs Collective Decision-Making across Cultures,"** Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, March 24, 2015.

۱۳. Chris Mooney, **"The Science of Protecting People's Feelings: Why We Pretend All Opinions Are Equal,"** *Washington Post* online, March 10, 2015.

۱۴. Karl Taro Greenfield, **"Faking Cultural Literacy,"** *New York Times* online, May 24, 2014.

۱۵. نقل شده در:

Chris Mooney, **"Liberals Deny Science, Too,"** *Washington Post* online, October 28, 2014

۱۶. یکی از تفاوت‌ها این است که محافظه‌کاران به داده‌های متضاد با باورهایشان واکنش شدیدتری نشان دادند. ولی محققان می‌گویند علت این امر آن است که «مسائلی که محافظه‌کاران را به واکنش وامی‌دارند، همان مسائلی‌اند که هم‌اکنون بیش از بقیه‌ی مسائل، جامعه را دوقطبی می‌کنند». نویسندگانْ این دیدگاه‌ها و بقیه‌ی دیدگاه‌هایی را که در ادامه می‌آیند، در یکی از مصاحبه‌های دانشگاه ایالت اوهایو بیان کرده‌اند:

فصل ۳

۱. Daniel W. Drezner, **"A Clash between Administrators and Students at Yale Went Viral,"** *Washington Post* online, November 9, 2015.

۲. «سرویس سنجش تحصیلی»، همان گروهی که آزمون توانمندی تحصیلی (SAT) را برگزار می‌کند، ضمن پژوهشی درباره‌ی دانشجویان کالج به این نتیجه رسید که افزایش سال‌های حضور در کالج به افزایش توانایی منجر نشده است. رجوع کنید به:

Educational Testing Service, *America's Skills Challenge: Millennials and the Future* (Princeton, NJ: Educational Testing Service, 2015).

۳. Ben Casselman, **"Shut Up about Harvard,"** FiveThirtyEight.com, March 30, 2016.

٤. James Piereson and Naomi Schaefer Riley, **"Remedial Finance: The Outsized Cost of Playing Academic Catch-Up,"** *Weekly Standard* online, May 9, 2016.

٥. Robert Hughes, *Culture of Complaint* (New York: Time Warner, 1993), 68.

۶. Valerie Strauss, **“I Would Love to Teach, But …,”** *Washington Post* online, December 31, 2013.

۷. Emma Brown, **“Former Stanford Dean Explains Why Helicopter Parenting Is Ruining a Generation of Children,”** *Washington Post* online, October 16, 2015.

۸. Megan McArdle, **“Sheltered Students Go to College, Avoid Education,”** BloombergView.com, August 13, 2015.

۹. Jeffrey J. Selingo, **“Helicopter Parents Are Not the Only Problem. Colleges Coddle Students, Too,”** *Washington Post*, October 21, 2015.

۱۰. Robby Soave, **“Yale Students Tell English Profs to Stop Teaching English: Too Many White Male Poets,”** Reason.com, June 1, 2016.

۱۱. Jonathan D. Glater, **“To: Professor@University.edu Subject: Why It’s All about Me,”** *New York Times* online, February 22, 2006.

۱۲. James V. Schall, *Another Sort of Learning* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1988), 30–37.

۱۳. David Dunning, **"We Are All Confident Idiots,"** *Pacific Standard* online, October 27, 2014.

۱۴. کالج ایالتی کستلتون، کالج کوچکی در ورمونت که اکنون «دانشگاه» است، یکی از نمونه‌های فراوانی از این دست است که فقط در «نیوانگلند» یافت می‌شوند. رجوع کنید به:

Lisa Rathke, "**Switching from a College to a University Could Mean More Money, More Students,"** *Huffington Post*, July 12, 2015.

۱۵. Catherine Rampell, **"The Rise of the 'Gentleman's A' and the GPA Arms Race,"** *Washington Post* online, March 28, 2016.

۱۶. Richard Arum, **"College Graduates: Satisfied, but Adrift,"** in Mark Bauerlein and Adam Bellow, eds., *The State of the American Mind* (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton, 2015), 68.

۱۷. داده‌های ۲۰۱۶ بسط پژوهش‌هایی‌اند که پیش‌تر استوارد راجستسر و کریس هیلی انجام داده بودند. آن‌ها پس از نوشتن مقاله‌هایی درباره‌ی این موضوع در سال ۲۰۱۰ و ۲۰۱۲ فرایند گردآوری داده را ادامه دادند. پایگاه داده‌ی آن‌ها در سایت www.gradeinflation.com در دسترس است.

۱۸. فقـط بـرای دو نمونـه از گزارش‌هـا و واکنش‌های محافظه‌کاران و لیبرال‌ها رجوع کنید به:

"Yale Students Erupt in Anger over Administrators Caring More about Free Speech Than Safe Spaces," *Slate*, November 7, 2015;

و

Shoshanna Weismann, **"How Babies Are Made,"** *Weekly Standard*, November 10, 2015.

۱۹. Mará Rose Williams, **"Race Protests at Mizzou Could Stunt Freshmen Enrollment,"** *Kansas City Star* online, January 13, 2016.

۲۰. Conor Friedersdorf, **"The New Intolerance of Student Activism,"** *Atlantic.* online, November 9, 2015.

۲۱. Glenn Reynolds, **"After Yale, Mizzou, raise the voting age—to 25,"** *USA Today* online, November 16, 2015.

فصل ۴

۱. Adrienne LaFrance, **“Raiders of the Lost Internet,”** *Atlantic* online, October 14, 2015.

۲. Nicholas Carr, **“Is Google Making Us Stupid?,”** *Atlantic* online, July/ August 2008.

۳. Caitlin Dewey, **“What Was Fake on the Internet This Week: Why Do We Even Bother, Honestly?,”** *Washington Post* online, October 30, 2015.

٤. Caitlin Dewey, **“What Was Fake on the Internet This Week: Why This Is the Final Column,”** *Washington Post* online, December 18, 2015.

٥. Damian Thompson, *Counterknowledge* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2008), 11.

٦. Allen West, **“Obama’s America: Look What Our Troops Are Being FORCED to Do for Islam’s Holy Month,”** allenbwest.com, June 29, 2015.

۷. Michael Miller, **“Gwyneth Paltrow’s No Vagina Expert, Doctors Say,”** *People* online, January 29, 2015. Dr. Gunter’s blog is at drjengunter.wordpress.com.

۸. Laura Hooper Beck, **“I Went to a Spa for My Uterus and This Is My Story,”** FastCompany.com, January 27, 2015.

۹. Frank Bruni, **“California, Camelot and Vaccines,”** *New York Times* online, July 4, 2015.

۱۰. **“ ‘Stop Googling Your Symptoms,’ Teenage Cancer Victim Told before Death,”** *Daily Telegraph,* June 16, 2015.

۱۱. Matthew Fisher et al., **“Searching for Explanations: How the Internet Inflates Estimates of Internal Knowledge,”** *Journal of Experimental Psychology* 144(3), June 2015, 674–687.

۱۲. Tom Jacobs, **“Searching the Internet Creates an Illusion of Knowledge,”** *Pacific Standard* online, April 1, 2015.

۱۳. برای منبع این ارجاع و بقیه‌ی ارجاع‌ها رجوع کنید به مقاله‌ی زیر:

"The Google Generation: The Information Behaviour of the Researcher of the Future," January 11, 2008.

۱۴. Robert Epstein, **"How Google Could Rig the 2016 Election,"** *Politico*, August 19, 2015.

۱۵. James Surowiecki, *The Wisdom of Crowds* (New York: Anchor, 2005), xii–xiii.

۱۶. Quoted in Tom Simonite, **"The Decline of Wikipedia,"** *MIT Technology Review*, October 22, 2013.

۱۷. Ibid.

۱۸. Andrea Peterson, **"Liberals Are More Likely to Unfriend You over Politics— Online and Off,"** *Washington Post* online, October 21, 2014.

۱۹. A. O. Scott, **"Everybody's a Critic. And That's How It Should Be,"** *New York Times Sunday Review* online, January 30, 2016.

۲۰. Andrew Sullivan, "**Democracies End When They Are Too Democratic**", *New York* online, May 1, 2016.

۲۱. به‌ویژه برندن نیهان، یکی از پژوهشگران کالج دارتموث، دراین‌باره تحقیق کرده که چرا وقتی اثبات می‌شود اشتباه کرده‌ایم، بیشتر بر موضع خود پافشاری می‌کنیم. رجوع کنید به:

Joe Keohane, **"How Facts Backfire: Researchers Discover a Surprising Threat to Democracy: Our Brains,"** *Boston Globe* online, July 11, 2010.

۲۲. David Dunning, **"We Are All Confident Idiots,"** *Pacific Standard* online, October 27, 2014.

۲۳. Megan McArdle, **"Your Assessment of the Election Is Way Off,"** *Forbes* online, April 14, 2016.

فصل ۵

١. Sarah Kaplan, **"How, and Why, a Journalist Tricked News Outlets into Thinking Chocolate Makes You Thin,"** *Washington Post* online, May 28, 2015.

٢. Mollie Hemingway, **"*Vox*'s Motto Should Be 'Explaining the News Incorrectly, Repeatedly,' "** TheFederalist.com, July 17, 2014.

٣. Elisabetta Povoledo, **"Pope Calls for 'Peace in All the World' in First Easter Message,"** *New York Times* online, March 31, 2013.

٤. Pew Research Center, **"The Age of Indifference: A Study of Young Americans and How They View the News,"** June 28, 1990, 1.

٥. Richard Arum, **"College Graduates: Satisfied, but Adrift,"** in Mark Bauerlein and Adam Bellow, eds., *The State of the American Mind* (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton, 2015), 73.

٦. James E. Short, **"How Much Media? Report on American Consumers."** 2013. Institute for Communication Technology Management, Marshall School of Business, University of

Southern California, http://classic.marshall.usc.edu/ assets/161/25995.pdf.

۷. Jan Zverina, **"U.S. Media Consumption to Rise to 15.5 Hours a Day—Per Person—by 2015,"** UC San Diego News Center, November 6, 2013.

۸. Quoted in Benjamin Mullen, **"Buyouts Hit the *Dallas Morning News*,"** Poynter. org, July 7, 2015.

۹. Quoted in Jeremy Peters, **"Some Newspapers, Tracking Readers Online, Shift Coverage,"** *New York Times* online, September 5, 2010.

۱۰. Peters, **"Some Newspapers, Tracking Readers Online, Shift Coverage."**

۱۱. National Journal Group, *Washington in the Information Age*, 2015, Washington, DC.

۱۲. Steven Metz, **"As Celebrity Pundits Rise, U.S. National Security Policy Suffers,"** *World Politics Review*, August 14, 2015.

۱۳. Mindich in Bauerlein and Bellow, *State of the American Mind*, 101.

۱٤. R. R. Reno, **“Trumpageddon!,”** *First Things* online, February 20, 2016.

۱٥. Eliot Cohen, **“The Age of Trump,”** *American Interest* online, February 26, 2016.

۱٦. Anne Pluta, **“Trump Supporters Appear to Be Misinformed, Not Uninformed,”** FiveThirtyEight.com, January 7, 2016.

۱۷. Justin McCarthy, **“Trust in Mass Media Returns to All-Time Low,”** Gallup.com, September 17, 2014.

۱۸. Paul Farhi, **“How Biased Are the Media, Really?,”** *Washington Post* online, April 27, 2012.

۱۹. Dale Maharidge, **“People’s Stories: What Happens When No One Wants to Print Their Words Anymore?,”** *Nation* online, March 2, 2016.

۲۰. Michael Nunez, **“Want to Know What Facebook Really Thinks of Journalists? Here’s What Happened When It Hired Some,”** Gizmodo.com, May 3, 2016.

۲۱. Will Saletan, **“Unhealthy Fixation,”** Slate.com, July 15, 2015.

۲۲. John Bohannon, **“I Fooled Millions into Thinking Chocolate Helps Weight Loss. Here’s How,”** io9.Gizmodo.com, May 27, 2015.

۲۳. Joshua Foust, **“The Birth (and Death) of a Meme: Embedded Reporters Don’t Always Get the Story,”** *Columbia Journalism Review* online, September 10, 2008.

۲٤. Sheila Coronel, Steve Coll, and Derek Kravitz, **“*Rolling Stone*’s Investigation: ‘A Failure That Was Avoidable,’ ”** *Columbia Journalism Review* online, April 5, 2015.

۲۵. Emily Yoffe, **“The College Rape Overcorrection,”** Slate.com, December 7, 2014.

۲٦. Quoted in Greg Jaffe, **“VA Study Finds More Veterans Committing Suicide,”** *Washington Post* online, February 1, 2013.

۲۷. Brandon Friedman, **“Military Suicides Top Combat Deaths—But Only Because the Wars Are Ending,”** *TIME* online, January 16, 2013.

فصل ۶

۱. Helen Thompson, **"Teen Schools Professor on 'No Irish Need Apply' Signs,"** Smithsonian.com, August 5, 2015.

۲. Geoffrey Norman, **"Do I Dare to Eat an Egg,"** *The Weekly Standard* online, March 16, 2015.

۳. Peter Whoriskey, **"The Science of Skipping Breakfast: How Government Nutritionists May Have Gotten It Wrong,"** *Washington Post* online, August 10, 2015.

٤. Seweryn Bialer and Joan Afferica, **"Reagan and Russia,"** *Foreign Affairs*, Winter 1982–1983, 263.

٥. Stephen M. Meyer, **"Testimony before the Senate Foreign Relations Committee,"** in Theodore Karasik, ed., *Russia and Eurasia Armed Forces Review Annual* 15, 1991 (Gulf Breeze, FL: Academic International Press, 1999), 348.

٦. Richard Ned Lebow and Thomas Risse Kappen, **"Introduction,"** in Richard Ned Lebow and Thomas Risse Kappen, eds., *International Relations Theory and the End of the Cold*

War (New York: Columbia University Press, 1995), 2.

۷. ده کشور عبارت‌اند از ایالات متحده، روسیه، بریتانیا، فرانسه، جمهوری خلق چین، هند، پاکستان، کره‌ی شمالی، رژیم صهیونیستی (اعلام نکرده) و آفریقای جنوبی (کنار گذاشته). زمانی که رژیم آپارتاید در آفریقای جنوبی، که سازنده‌ی تسلیحات هسته‌ای بود، سرنگون شد، آن تسلیحات هم خنثی شدند.

۸. W. Ian Lipkin, **"Anti-Vaccination Lunacy Won't Stop,"** *Wall Street Journal* online, April 3, 2016.

۹. See Richard Van Noorden, **"Political Science's Problem with Research Ethics,"** ***Nature*** **online, June 29, 2015; Brian C. Martinson, Melissa S. Anderson, and Raymond de Vries, "Scientists Behaving Badly,"** *Nature* 435 (June 9, 2005): 737–738.

۱۰. Carl Zimmer, **"A Sharp Rise in Retractions Prompts Calls for Reform,"** *New York Times* online, April 16, 2012.

۱۱. Benedict Carey, **"Many Psychology Findings Not as Strong as Claimed, Study Says,"** *New York Times* online, August 27, 2015.

۱۲. Quoted in Rachel Gross, **"Psychologists Call Out the Study That Called Out the Field of Psychology,"** Slate.com, March 3, 2016.

۱۳. Daniel Engber, **"Cancer Research Is Broken,"** Slate.com, April 19, 2016.

۱٤. Garret Epps, **"Genuine Christian Scholars Smack Down an Unruly Colleague,"** *Atlantic* online, August 10, 2012.

۱٥. **"Actresses' Role in Farm Issue Stirs Criticism,"** *Los Angeles Times* online archive, May 3, 1985.

۱٦. Jessica Goldstein, **"Is Gwyneth Paltrow Wrong about Everything? This Scientist Thinks So,"** ThinkProgress.com, April 21, 2016.

۱۷. Alexandra Petri, **"Dr. Carson, This Is Not Brain Surgery,"** *Washington Post* online, November 5, 2015.

۱۸. This account is drawn from Paul Offit, **"The Vitamin Myth: Why We Think We Need Supplements,"** *Atlantic* online, July 19, 2013.

۱۹. Helen Caldicott, *Missile Envy* (New York: Bantam, 1985), 235; Helen Caldicott, *If You Love This Planet* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1992), 156.

۲۰. شـایعه اسـت که یکی از پیش‌بینی‌های کریسـول خیلی دقیق بوده است. ظاهراً او در ماه مارس ۱۹۶۳ در مصاحبه‌ای با جک پار گفته بـود رئیس‌جمهـور کندی در انتخابات ۱۹۶۴ شـرکت نخواهد کرد، زیرا در نوامبر ۱۹۶۳ اتفاقی برای او خواهد افتاد. ولی این هم ممکن است جزو افسانه‌های محلی باشد، مگر اینکه کسی فایل صوتی یا تصویری آن مصاحبه را پیدا کند.

۲۱. Carl Bialik, **"Most Pollsters Say Their Reputations Have Worsened,"** FiveThirtyEight.com, December 28, 2015.

۲۲. Clive Thompson, **"Can Game Theory Predict When Iran Will Get the Bomb?"** *New York Times Magazine* online, August 12, 2009.

۲۳. Nassim Nicholas Taleb, *The Black Swan* (New York: Random House, 2010), xxiv–xxv.

۲٤. Philip E. Tetlock, *Expert Political Judgment* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2005), 20.

۲٥. Tetlock, *Expert Political Judgment*, 20.

۲٦. James Surowiecki, *The Wisdom of Crowds* (New York: Anchor, 2005), 31.

۲۷. Tetlock, *Expert Political Judgment*, 21.

۲۸. See Tetlock, *Expert Political Judgment*, 101–103.

۲۹. See, for example, Tina Nguyen, **"How Nate Silver Failed to Predict Trump,"** *Vanity Fair*, February 1, 2016.

۳۰. Noah Rothman, **"Why They Think Trump Can Win in Nov?,"** *Commentary* online, April 27, 2016.

۳۱. Tetlock, *Expert Political Judgment*, 23.

جمع‌بندی

۱. See James Traub, **"First, They Came for the Experts,"** *Foreign Policy*, July 7, 2016.

۲. Quoted in Michael Deacon, **"Michael Gove's Guide to Britain's Greatest Enemy ... the Experts,"** *Telegraph* online, June 10, 2016.

۳. Quoted in Stephen Castle, **"Having Won, Some 'Brexit' Campaigners Begin Backpedaling,"** *New York Times* online, June 26, 2016.

٤. Quoted in Nick Gass, **"Trump: 'The Experts Are Terrible,' "** Politico.com, April 4, 2016.

٥. David Dunning, **"The Psychological Quirk That Explains Why You Love Donald Trump,"** Politico.com, May 25, 2016.

٦. See, for example, Jennifer Kerr, **"Educational Divide in GOP White House Race: What's behind It," Associated Press, April 3, 2016; Max Ehrenfreund, "The Outlandish Conspiracy Theories Many of Donald Trump's Supporters Believe," *Washington Post* online, May 5, 2016; Scott Clement, "Donald Trump Is Splitting the White Vote in Ways**

We've Never Seen Before," *Washington Post* online, May 31, 2016.

۷. The journalist Jeffrey Goldberg, for one, claimed that Samuels was using the piece to settle a personal score with him. See Jeffrey Goldberg, **"Ben Rhodes and the 'Retailing' of the Iran Deal,"** *Atlantic* online, May 9, 2016.

۸. David Samuels, **"The Aspiring Novelist Who Became Obama's Foreign-Policy Guru,"** *New York Times Sunday Magazine* online, May 5, 2016.

۹. در یکی از اپیزودهای کلاسیک مجموعه‌ی «پیشتازان فضا» که نخستین بار در ۱۹۶۸ پخش شد، یک استاد، با حسن‌نیتِ تمام تلاش کرد یک سیاره‌ی کامل را بر اساس تجربه‌ی نازی‌ها سازمان‌دهی کند. نتیجه فاجعه‌ای تمام‌عیار بود، ولی آن استاد حتی در حال مرگ هم آلمان نازی را «کارآمدترین کشوری که زمین به خودش دیده» توصیف کرد، و راوی (آقای اسپاک) هم گفت: «کاملاً درست است.» ولی حقیقت این است که آلمان نازی به‌شدت گرفتار فساد و ناکارآمدی بود و بسیاری از دانشمندان و اندیشمندانش پس از ۱۹۳۳ از آن کشور گریختند. با این حال، بسیاری از آمریکایی‌ها هنوز اسطوره‌ی کارآمدی آلمان نازی را باور دارند.

۱۰. Daniel Libit, **"How the Expert Class Got Trumped and Berned,"** CNBC.com, May 12, 2016.

۱۱. Susan Jacoby, **“The Dumbing of America,”** *Washington Post* online, February 17, 2008.

۱۲. Friedrich Hayek, *The Constitution of Liberty: The Definitive Edition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 378.

۱۳. Evan Thomas, **“Why We Need a Foreign Policy Elite,”** *New York Times* online, May 8, 2016.

۱٤. Andrew Bacevich, **“Rationalizing Lunacy: The Intellectual as Servant of the State,”** *Huffington Post*, May 8, 2015.

۱٥. Philip E. Tetlock, *Expert Political Judgment* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2005), 231–232.

۱٦. Malcolm Gladwell, “**Small Change: Why the Revolution Will Not Be Tweeted**,” *New Yorker*, October 4, 2010.

۱۷. Ilya Somin, **“Political Ignorance in America,”** in Mark Bauerlein and Adam Bellow, eds., *The State of the American Mind* (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton, 2015), 166.

۱۸. Neetzan Zimmerman, **"Kimmel Fools Hillary Supporters into Backing Trump's Tax Plan,"** *The Hill*, September 30, 2015.

۱۹. Ariel Edwards-Levy, **"Republicans Like Obama's Ideas Better When They Think They're Donald Trump's,"** *Huffpost Politics*, September 1, 2015.

۲۰. Nick Saffran, **"Wipe That Grin Off Your Smug Faces, Progressive Pollsters,"** TheFederalist.com, December 29, 2015.

۲۱. Derek Kohler, "**Why People Are Confused about What Experts Really Think**," *New York Times* online, February 14, 2016.

۲۲. Jacoby, **"Dumbing Of America."**

۲۳. C. S. Lewis, *The Screwtape Letters with Screwtape Proposes a Toast* (New York: Image, 1981), 136–139 (emphases in the original).

۲٤. José Ortega y Gasset, *The Revolt of the Masses* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1993), 18.

۲۵. See Libit, **“How the Expert Class Got Trumped and Berned”; and Julie Beck, “Americans Believe in Science, Just Not Its Findings,”** *Atlantic* online, January 29, 2015.

۲۶. James Traub, “**It’s Time for the Elites to Rise Up against the Ignorant Masses**”, *Foreign Policy*, June 28, 2016.

۲۷. Andrew Sullivan, **“Democracies End When They Are Too Democratic,”** NYMag.com, May 1, 2016.